The Member being then absent the following resolution was considered withdrawn.

Mr. P. Raman Menon.—"*This Council recommends to the Government that instead of the Diwan Peishkar, the Superintendent of Registration be ex-officio Commissioner of Income-tax*".

5. Committtee to effect retrenchment in the administration.

മിസ്റ്റർ ടി. കെ. നായർ.—സർ, ഞാൻ ഇവിടെ അവതരിപ്പിക്കുന്ന പ്രമേയം ഇതാണ്.

This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a Committee of non-officials to effect all possible retrenchment in the various departments of administration in the State.

ഈ പ്രമേയം ഇവിടെ അവതരിപ്പിക്കുംപോൾ അനുദ്യോഗസ്ഥ മെമ്പർമാരിൽ പലർക്കും ഇതിനെപ്പറ്റി തല്ക്കാലം ഒരു തെറ്റിദ്ധാരണയുണ്ടായേക്കാം. ഗവൺമെണ്ടിൽ നിന്നും ഈ നിയമസഭയിൽ നിന്നും ഓരോരോ സംഗതികൾക്കായി ഓരോരോ കമ്മിറ്റിയെ നിയമിച്ചു കൊച്ചി രാജ്യം മുഴുവനും നിറച്ചിട്ടുള്ള ഈ കാലത്ത് ഒരു കമ്മിറ്റി കൂടി വെക്കണമെന്നുള്ള പ്രമേയം കൊണ്ടുവന്നതിനെപ്പറ്റി ആരെങ്കിലും തെറ്റിദ്ധരിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടെങ്കിൽ അതിൽ വളരെ അത്ഭുതപ്പെടുവാനില്ല. എന്നാൽ ഇന്ന് നമ്മുടെ ഗവൺമെൻറ് പലതരത്തിലും നടത്തിവരുന്നതായ അനാവശ്യചിലവുകൾ നിർത്തേണ്ടതിലേക്ക് ഞങ്ങൾ ഓരോ തരത്തിൽ ഓരോപ്രമേയങ്ങൾ ഇവിടെ അവതരിപ്പിച്ച് പാസ്സാക്കിയതിനെല്ലാം ആർഡർ പാസാക്കുവാനുള്ള അധികാരം ഗവൺമെൻറുദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാക്കായതുകൊണ്ട് അവരുടെ സൌകര്യംപോലെ ഓരോ ആർഡർ പാസ്സാക്കി ഞങ്ങളുടെ ഉദ്ദേശത്തെ തീരെ ഇല്ലായ്മചെയ്തുവരുന്ന ഒരൊറ്റകാരണം കൊണ്ടാണ് ഇങ്ങിനെ ഒരു കമ്മിറ്റി വേണമെന്ന് ഞാൻ നിർബ്ബന്ധിക്കുന്നത്.

ഒന്നാമതായി ഞാൻ ഒരു സംഗതി പറയാം. ഇന്നത്തെ വകുപ്പധ്യക്ഷന്മാരുടേയും മറ്റും ശമ്പളം വളരെ വളരെ അധികമാണെന്ന് ഞങ്ങൾക്കു തോന്നിയിട്ടുള്ള അഭിപ്രായത്തെ ഞങ്ങൾ ഇവിടെ പലതവണയും പ്രസ്താവിക്കുകയും അതു എങ്ങിനെ കുറക്കണമെന്നുള്ളതിലേയ്ക്ക് ഓരോ തോതുകൾ വച്ച് ഞാൻതന്നെ ഒരു പ്രമേയം ഈ സഭയിൽ കൊണ്ടുവരികയും അതു ഇവിടെപാസാക്കുകയും ചെയ്തിട്ടുണ്ട്. അതിനു എന്താണ് ഗവൺമെണ്ടിന്റെ തീരുമാനമുണ്ടായതു? എന്നുമുതൽ ശമ്പളംവാങ്ങുന്ന ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാർക്കും 500 രൂപ ശമ്പളം വാങ്ങുന്ന ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാർക്കും ഒന്നുപോലെ ശമ്പളം കുറയ്ക്കുകയാണ് ചെയ്തതു. ഏറ്റവും അധികം ശമ്പളം വാങ്ങുന്ന ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാർക്ക് ഇരുപതോ ഇരുപത്തഞ്ചോ ശതമാനം കുറക്കണമെന്നു ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടതിനെ ഗവൺമെണ്ട് തീരെ ഇല്ലായ്മചെയ്തു. ശമ്പളം കുറയ്ക്കണമെന്ന് പറയുവാനല്ലാതെ അതിനുള്ള ഓർഡർ പാസാക്കുവാൻ ഞങ്ങൾക്കധികാര

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

മില്ല. ആ അധികാരം ശമ്പളം വാങ്ങുന്നവക്കാണ്. ഇതിലേയ്ക്കും മറ്റുമായി ഒരു കമ്മിറ്റിയെവച്ച് ഒരു നിവാരണ മാർഗ്ഗം ഉണ്ടാക്കണമെന്നാണ് എന്റെ അഭിപ്രായം. ഇതിനടിസ്ഥാനമായി ഇതിനു മുമ്പൊരിയ്ക്കൽ ഇങ്ങനെ ഒരു കമ്മിറ്റിയെ വെക്കുകയുണ്ടായി. Retrenchment നാണ് കമ്മിറ്റിയെ വെച്ചത്. ഒടുവിൽ അത് സ്പെഷ്യൽ ഫിനാൻസു കമ്മിറ്റിയായി. ശമ്പളം കുറയ്ക്കണമെന്നു അവർ പറഞ്ഞതു കേൾക്കാതെ കൂട്ടുകയാണുചെയ്തതു. ശമ്പളം കൂട്ടുകയും അപൂർവ്വം ചിലതു കുറയ്ക്കുകയും മാറുകയും മറിക്കുകയും ഒന്നിൽനിന്നു കുറച്ച് വേറൊന്നിൽ കൂട്ടുകയും ഇങ്ങിനെ പലതരത്തിലും ചെയ്ത് ഒരുവിധം അവസാനിപ്പിച്ചു.

"It is a mistaken policy to compare the salaries of our men in the higher grades of service with those of the corresponding appointments in the British service". etc.

"A small state like Cochin cannot obviously afford the lavish scale of salaries followed in BritishIndia. While a large number of departmental demi-gods are afforded therun of public revenues, the vast majority of the little ones are put on ratios not even scientifically sufficient to maintain the earthly contact of body and soul".

ഇങ്ങിനെയാണ് അവർ അഭിപ്രായപ്പെട്ടത്. ഇതുകൊണ്ടു യാതൊരു ഫലവുമുണ്ടായിട്ടില്ല. അവരുടെ അഭിപ്രായങ്ങളിൽ ഒന്നുരണ്ടു വാചകങ്ങൾകൂടി ഇവിടെ വായിക്കാം.

"In Cochin public service is looked upon as a means of personal aggrendisement. Compared to the average income of the people of Cochin, may even of the rich classes, the departmental heads need be paid only (1) Rs. 400—600, (2) Rs. 250—400 and (3) Rs. 200—300".

കമ്മിറ്റിക്കാർ ഇതു വളരെ ആലോചിച്ച് ചെയ്തിട്ടുള്ളതാണ്. അന്നു വളരെപ്പണം കെട്ടിക്കിടപ്പുള്ള കാലമായിരുന്നു. അന്ന് ലക്ഷക്കണക്കായ് കെട്ടിക്കിടപ്പുണ്ടായിരുന്ന രാജ്യത്തു് ഇപ്പോൾ കടംകൂടി വാങ്ങേണ്ടതായിവന്നു. ഈ സമയത്തു് ശമ്പളത്തോതു് അന്നത്തെ അഭിപ്രായത്തിൽ എത്രയെത്രയൊ കീഴ്പ്പോട്ടു പോകേണ്ടതാണ്. നെല്ലിന്റെ വിലയും നാളികേരത്തിന്റെ വിലയും ഈ കാലത്തു് അന്നത്തേതിൽ വളരെകുറഞ്ഞിട്ടുണ്ടു്. ഇങ്ങനെയിരിക്കെ ഉദ്ദേശസാദ്ധ്യത്തിനായി വേറെതരത്തിൽ ഒരു പ്രമേയംമൂലം ശമ്പളം സംഗതം കൊണ്ടുവരുവാൻ ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടാൽ നാമെന്തു് സമ്മതിക്കും, സമ്മതിച്ചു, ഇല്ലെങ്കിൽ ഇല്ല. എന്നാൽ ഓരോ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെണ്ടിൽ കടന്നുനോക്കി ജോലി തീർക്കുവാൻമാത്രം ആവശ്യമുള്ള ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാരെവച്ചു് അതിലെ അനാവശ്യചിലവുകൾ കുറയ്ക്കുകയും കാലസ്ഥിതിയനുസരിച്ചു് ചെയ്യേണ്ടതായ മറ്റു മാറ്റങ്ങൾ പലതും ചെയ്താൽ തീപ്പിയായും ചിലവു് വളരെ കുറയ്ക്കുവാൻ സാധിക്കുമെന്നാണ് എന്റെ ബോദ്ധ്യം. പല ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെണ്ടുകളും കൂട്ടിച്ചേർത്തു് ചിലവു് കുറയ്ക്കുവാനും വഴിയുണ്ടു്. Heads of Departments നെ അധികരിപ്പിക്കുവാനുള്ള പകപ്പുവ്യാധിയെ ഇല്ലായ്മ ചെയ്യുവാനും മറ്റും. മറ്റും—ഇങ്ങനെ ഒരു ഡസനിനധികം മറ്റും പറഞ്ഞാലും തര-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ക്കേടില്ല. ഉള്ള അധികാരത്തോടു കൂടി ഒരു കമ്മറ്റിയെ നിശ്ചയിക്കണമെന്നാണ് ഞാൻ പറയുന്നത്.

ഈ പ്രമേയത്തിൽ റിട്ടഞ്ചുമെൻറിൻറെ കാര്യമല്ലാതെ വേറെ യാതൊന്നും ഞാൻ പറയുന്നില്ല. എവിടെയൊക്കെ അനാവശ്യച്ചിലവുകൾ കുറയ്ക്കുവാൻ സാധിക്കുമോ അതെല്ലാം കുറയ്ക്കുവാൻവേണ്ടിമാത്രം ഒരു കമ്മിറ്റിയെ നിയമിക്കേണ്ടതാണെന്നു് ഒരൊറ്റ അപേക്ഷയെ എനിക്കുള്ളു. അതിലേക്ക് എന്തെല്ലാമാണ് വേണ്ടതെന്നു് ഇതിൽകൂടുതലായി പ്രസംഗിക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമൊന്നുമില്ല. അതു സഭയ്ക്കുണ്ടിന്നും അനുഭാവസ്ഥമെമ്പർമാർക്കും അറിവുള്ളതാണ്. ഇതിനെസംബന്ധിച്ചു മറ്റു മെമ്പർമാരുടേയും സഭയ്ക്കുണ്ടിൻറേയും അഭിപ്രായം അറിഞ്ഞതിനുശേഷം ഞാൻ കൂടുതൽ വിവരമായി പറയേണമെങ്കിൽ മറുപടിയിൽ പറഞ്ഞുകൊള്ളാം.

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—I second the resolution.

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—I have to oppose the motion on behalf of the Government. I may assure the Hon'ble mover of the resolution that any representation made by the House is sure to receive the sympathetic consideration of the Government.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I question that statement.

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—I am not surprised. He is famous for his questions.

The Government honestly think that it is too early to think of effecting further retrenchments, without seriously affecting the efficiency of the departments. You have heard the Hon'ble Mover of the resolution and it will be observed that he concentrated himself on one topic namely the salary of the officers and for the rest he could not give any reason at all in support of the resolution. Therefore he used *mattum*. This word *mattum* is generally used by everybody when no other good reason is forth coming. My learned friends who belong to the legal profession will bear me out when I say that generally they take shelter under the word *mattum* in preparing written statements when they have exhausted all mentionable contentions. That is what has happened in the case of my friend also. Therefore the only one argument that was advanced by the mover of the resolution with regard to the resolution before the House is the desirability of reducing the pay of the heads of Departments. It is rather curious that a committee of non-officials should sit in judgment to effect retrenchments in the administration of departments. But at the same time I am not taking exception to the principle. The House will be pleased to see that there are serious working difficulties in the matter. For instance this committee may not be in a position to know the details of the working of each department. I very much doubt whether a committee of this sort contemplated by the resolution will have an intimate knowledge

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of any of the departments. I mean no disparagement to the Hon'ble Members. Hon'ble Members on the non official side cannot be expected to have an intimate knowledge of the working details of every department. If it is urged that they will acquire a mastery of details after sitting in the committee and after taking time then obviously we have to think of the financial commitments involved in first taking time to learn and then to suggest retrenchments. But if it is argued that they know all about Departments even before going into the committee then I am reminded of Disraili's definition of the Committee, as 'a cumbrous machinery to find out what everybody knows already'. The Government is always willing to consider sympathetically specific constructive proposals. But the difficulty of appointing a non official committee to find out ways of retrenchments in the various departments or sub departments of one office are obvious and I do not think it is necessary to multiply reasons. This is something like asking us officials to find out ways and means of curtailing the privileges of the members of this House.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Are we not already doing it?

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—I submit, Sir, it is not a practical proposition. Government would however, only be too glad to consider constructive recommendations. I am constrined to oppose this resolution.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I was, no doubt, hearing with much pleasure the speech delivered by the leader of the House which practically contained nothing but some good words. With that legal subtility of mind and quibble and a special fascination or special aptitude for converting words to suit different kinds of meaning he has always succeeded in presenting a case which on the face of it appears to be reasonable. He has presented a similar case to us to-day. Now I ask a question, whether they have carried out the recommendations of the Finance Committee; and my Hon'ble friend is very anxious about the pay of the Heads of Departments. Why?—because the recommendations of the Special Finance Committee was set aside by the Government because it affected their interests. Government have no sense of decency, no sense of shame to help these Heads of Departments, at least those who have power, who are favourites of the Government, to help themselves to the fullest extent. At the same time they had the audacity to recommend the retirement of officers drawing Rs. 10 and Rs. 15 without any pension, people who work in the malarial tracts. Perhaps the only compensation for pension was a doze of quinine for the malaria. These are the recommendations that the ingenuity of your brain and the high character which you possess that were promulgated for our acceptance from that side. Now we may not be enfightening you but the enlightenment thrown from that side in

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

matters dealing with yourselves and your subordinates is nothing. We have never said that the pay of the subordinates should be reduced. We have concentrated our attacks upon your pay and T. A. Will there be any instance where we recommended a lower pay to the subordinate officer? The committee that is intended to be appointed by the resolution is not to reduce the pay of the officers but to put a stop to the practice of spending money at your sweet will and pleasure.

Now tell me what is this Government. In the Revenue Department the Diwan Peishkar is the Government. The argument that may be advanced is that we will not be in a position to understand the intricacies of his department. This argument equally applies to my friend. Surely I know as much of the Revenue Department as my friend Mr. Cherian knows. Therefore the argument that Government are a composite body and when one of them says, 'I represent the Government of my department' it is without any foundation. What does he represent? He represents his individual opinion. The opinion of all the twelve on that side, I should think, put together does not carry as much weight, as that of half a dozen who sit on this side. It does not carry even an iota more of weight. There is another thing. Our Heads of departments are gentlemen, efficient men and it requires years of training to make one efficient. Probably the gentleman sitting last was a judicial officer for a quarter of a century. I cannot understand what knowledge he possesses about the Excise Department. Then take the case of our Diwan Peishkar. He has put in four years' service in the Government and he has filled almost all the posts. Now Sir, we do not lay claim to such a brilliant intellect as you gentlemen possess. But if in four years you can study five departments are we not able to study one department in four years? It is not fair to think that we are below the average; what you can master within four years we can master in forty years. But to say that we are unable to master anything is going too far. The intricacies of the department is simply an obstruction. The essence of the whole thing is they are willing to give you a sham show. I have said many a time in this House that this is a law class, a debating society possessing no power at all. Any suggestions that come from this side will be unanimously opposed by that section there. (*Shame, shame.*) They will do it. They are here to oust us from our places just as we are here to oust them from their places.

My friend gave us an instance of their retrenchment but unfortunately he chose a wrong example. He spoke about the Medical Department. Now I ask what was the amount you saved by the introduction of the system of honorary doctors. We find a number of appointments going on in every department

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

regularly To man sixty patients there are 17 doctors and they are quarrelling with one another each one for getting two or three beds. You laugh, but it is a fact. It seems so absurd that nobody would think it is a fact. They would not allow any competent man to compete with them. The Chief Medical Officer has no objection. But place along with him another. There is some difficulty. For that you can go to Madras where there is the honorary system. If you cannot do anything substantial then why play this humbug. People are so foolish they cannot see though this game. The truth is none of these gentlemen are in favour ofextending any such privileges to this side of the House. ForPower is a limited quantity and the little we would take is being lost there. What is gained by us is lost by them. Therefore it is their duty to oppose all these things. If you appoint a committee they would go into the question of spending the three lakhs of rupees now specially alloted to the medical department. Perhaps they want to construct marble halls when the next Viceroy comes. Go to the taluks and in reality you will find nothing but wooden tables and dirty rooms without any instrument at all. Now what does he propose to do with this amount. I have got an inclining. You have a Cochin State which means Ernakulam and Trichur and the citizens of Cochin State means the men of Ernakulam and Trichur. They propose to spend the whole amount in these two places. Can you conceive of greater irresponsibility exhibited by a head of a department. The money that has to be utilised for purpose of giving medical relief is to be utilised for constructing buildings, towers, marble palaces and all these things. This is the way in which the whole money is to be spent. The committee will check you. Why do you want these two lakhs of rupees. Let us know. There is no need of a marble hall. We have got so many marble halls in the General Hospital. We have too many operation tables, operation tables costing Rs. 850 and Rs. 1,000 in the General Hospital which we do not find in the General Hospital Madras. Now why do you want these things.

What will the Government do? The Government will get a report from theChief Medical Officer. The Secretary will get up and say that the Chief Medical Officer has recommended it. They sanction it. They know the limitation of our powers. They do not know the power they possess. Now with regard to these three lakhs please say something to get over the difficulty 'we will consult you later on.' This answer was given because a question was put this morning. Otherwise they would have spent it in their own way. You are going to spend

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

it on the recommendation of Dr. Rao. He has one idea of improving while I have another. Having spent the whole amount you will say that the Government considered it necessary to do all these things. Even with our limitations, with our imperfect knowledge and with our imperfect knowledge of the intricacies of the department we would be able to suggest some constructive criticisms upon your department. The Government is only a nodder. If one person nodds all the others nodd. Therefore you gentlemen are all nodders.

Mr. P. V. Subramania Ayyar.—I am sorry that the resolution has been brought about owing to various anticipations based on wrong basis. The mover himself was mainly concerned with the salary cut especially of high paid departmental heads. As the Leader of the House himself said, the mover had nothing to say in respect of the retrenchments which have been brought forward by the Government in various items of expenditure, coming under the cost of administration as well as other items of expenditure. For instance, the Member failed to remember that in the course of 1107 and 1108 we have been able to reduce expenditure of nearly a lakh of rupees under T. A. The reduction under T. A has been brought about mainly by the reduced T. A. rates allowed to Government officers of over Rs. 300 and above. I do not say that rates of T. A have not been reduced in the case of others. There has been a reduction up to a salary of Rs. 100. In the case of those below Rs 100 the rates were not reduced; on the other hand the rates were enhanced. In respect of officers of Rs. 100 and above, there has been a very substantial reduction in Travelling allowance which the Government have been able to bring about in the course of one year. As regards contingencies, the Hon'ble Members will remember that they come under two classes, cost of administration and cost for running the department, that is, expenditure which every department had to incur to develop the various functions of the Government. In the case of contingencies coming under the cost of administration we have been able to reduce expenditure to the extent of 40 per cent. If I had time I would have been able to give accurate figures. In the case of the other contingencies, the Hon'ble Members would not deny the fact that the expenditure is essential for functioning the various items that each department has to do. Thus, wherever possible, Government have been able to reduce expenditure and wherever expenditure ought to be increased they have been increased especially in the case of Panchayats, Education, Public Works, Medical and Sanitary Department etc. Though the Hon'ble Member come and say that the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

expenditure has increased, the increase has been mainly due to the fact that the functions which each department had to do by way of developing public utilities have been increased. The Hon'ble Member for Cheruviruthi has baen bringing forward an insinuation that in the Medical Department no reduction in expenditure has been brought about. It is to be remembered that though the various dispensaries and hospitals have been better manned than before, this had been done without increasing the expenditure.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—On a point of order. You did not reduce expenditure and you did not reduce the paid posts also There are medical men to come forward and work without any remuneration whatsoever. Therefore my point is you did not reduce expenditure.

Mr. P. V. Subramania Ayyar.—The dispensaries and hospitals are better managed than before by the existence of better paid men. You cannot eat the pudding and have it at the same time. By the system of honorary doctors the department has been able to man certain hospitals and dispensaries better than before thereby increasing the utility of the hospitals to the public in general.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—But not by reducing expenditure.

Mr. P. V. Subramania Ayyar.—We cannot reduce it all of a sudden. You will be increasing expenditure by dispensing the services of these men by paying pensions to them. According to the vote of the Council we shall also have to require men for manning these hospitals and dispensaries, and those that are found in excess with the honorary doctors by their side will, no doubt, be observed in due course. Then again in making reference to the three lakhs which His Highness has donated, there were very wrong anticipations. In the first place there had been no suggestion at all to improve the hospitals of the Towns of Trichur and Ernakulam alone. There have been no room for the Hon'ble Member's apprehension that the expenditure of that fund would exclusively be devoted to Trichur and Ernakulam. Further, coming to the substantive portion of the resolution whether the existence of a non-official committee would improve matters in bringing about retrenchment, the only thing for consideration is whether they will be justified to effect a salary cut. In the first place, as the Leader of the House himself said, a non-official committee sitting the fate of the heads of departments is a thing for serious consideration.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We do not quite follow the Hon'ble Member.

Mr. P. V. Subramania Ayyar.—If I said otherwise, that is subject to correction. There had been many misunderstand-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ings on this account. Everybody used to think that every head of department has not sufficient work for the remuneration they draw. If only they come to know seriously what the position of a head of department here and their respective pay that is obtaining elsewhere there will not be room for such criticism. That is my point. For instance, I know that there has been a very serious argument that my office was overmanned. When the Special Finance Committee sat, six of its members wanted to inspect my office and to know whether the strength was necessary or any increased strength was required. They came to my office and inspected. The result was that they effected a ten per cent increase in the number of the staff.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan.—Your Boss was one of the Members.

Mr. P. V. Subramania Ayyar.—There were twelve other members also. I only wanted to show that there has been much misunderstanding with regard to the work of every head of department and the remuneration which they draw so that a cut in salary will not be justifiable.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—Mr. President, Sir, I am very sorry to find that even the Hon'ble Members of this House are not exempt from the usual definition of orthodoxy and hetrodoxy. It is only Sir just a few minutes ago we heard very eloquent speeches saying that we should immediately create three ministers who evidently should be on the top of these heads of departments on better pay and when the question of economy was suggested from the Government benches they said that it is so trifling a consideration on such a measure. I was about to say that already one committee has sat to effect readjustments within the internal machinery of Government; but now I find that committee has lost favour of this House at any rate not in the good books of this House namely the Special Finance Committee. Whatever that may be it seems to me Sir that any person who takes the view that the Government is an organic growth should feel that there is not something to tinker with it every few days, every few months or years. Retrenchment Committees are appointed by civilized Governments by all Governments. For instance in the Home Government in England there have been committees for retrenchment, committees presided over by permanent Secretaries of State and Members of Parliament. It may not be news to Members of this House, Sir, that it is only at intervals of centuries that such committees come and operate.

Well Sir, but all that may be beside the point. The obvious aim of this resolution may be stated in a few words, namely, to do away with the high paid heads of departments.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We did not say that.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—He said so during the discussions. He did not say that the pay of the heads of departments should be reduced, but he supplemented, Sir, if I remember aright, that they are not for reducing the salary of subordinate officers. What does that mean? It means Sir that the pay of the heads of departments should be reduced. That is the only conclusion. I speak subject to correction. Why make such circuitous committee for reducing the pay of the heads of departments? A resolution could very well be brought for the purpose and passed in this House.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We have done it many a time.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—What is the good of getting this committee? The avowed object of retrenchment, I can very well understand. If the object of the committee is to look into the needs of the administration and effect retrenchments wherever possible, effect them by all means. Here is a committee which stands committed to effect retrenchments and if it honestly does not effect retrenchments either it should dissolve itself at the end of six months or say we have no means of effecting economy. There is something in the nature of this committee weighted at one end which does not commend itself to me.

Sir, it will be no news to Hon'ble Members of this House that such machinery is already in operation. Internal adjustments are being made, old appointments are being cancelled and new ones are created only where there is absolute necessity. There is an internal adjustment which I should think works towards economy. Again I have to submit that there are two kinds of economies which Governments have been able to suggest, not here, but elsewhere. Temporary economies rendered necessary by passing depressions. They have to be called off as soon as depression ceases. Permanent retrenchments are necessary when Governments are overmanned. So if a committee at all is necessary, my submission, Sir, is that we should have a committee composed of officials and non-officials who should go into a matter of this kind. It is practised elsewhere also. I think it is at the beginning of the century that a committee was set up in England presided over by Lord Haldane. The committee was composed of permanent Secretaries of State and Members of Parliament, and they suggested certain economies of a temporary nature and with that they had to stop. But when the war came out instead of effecting further economies, they had to spend more.

Again Sir, I consider that a committee of this complexion in the first place is unsuitable for which it is meant. In the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

second place I consider it would give very short life to the machinery already set up. In the third place if you want to effect retrenchments on the salaries of certain people why put it in the hands of a committee ? I believe Sir that it is a very cumbrous machinery. I do not believe Sir that each one left to himself, even on the other side of the House, will feel convinced that there is the necessity to effect retrenchments, that Government is overmanned and that the heads of departments are not doing the work for the pay they draw. I honestly ask whether expert and honest service can be obtained without remuneration and if one only looks outside the Council to see how our services are remunerated when compared with other Governments, I think the result will be in our favour. I therefore strongly oppose this resolution.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—Sir, I rise to support this resolution. Originally I was one of those who was not much in favour of this resolution. But on hearing the speeches on the official side I came to the conclusion that I should support it.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Oh, you have become a convert.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—The argument that a committee of non-officials will not be competent to sit in judgment and suggest ways and means to bring about retrenchment is an argument which I would characterise as one without any force whatever, without any sense whatever. Till now if retrenchment committees for the purpose of reducing expenditure have failed, as far as my experience goes, it is due to the fact that some official members happened to be on that committee. It is always the official members in the committee somehow or other trying to get through this business, their pay and the pay of their subordinates that have spoiled one reports. That has been at the root of all trouble. We know as a matter of fact well that although the Special Finance Committee gave several ideas to the Government to effect retrenchments, when it came to the question of passing order the Government had to pass over several useful recommendations as it affected the pockets of several influential officers. I say if a committee is to be constituted it should be composed purely of non-officials and not by officials. I refuse to concede in the raised contention by some heads of departments that there is something mysterious in the working of the departments which non-officials will not be competent to go into. Don't be under that impression any longer. You, Sirs are all appointed to these offices by the merest of accidents and nothing else.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

I refuse to concede that the work done by the 12 members on the other side is such that we are not fit to go into without their concurrence. It is a mistaken and very erroneous idea that Hon'ble Members of this House are not competent even to suggest ways and means to reduce the expenditure.

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—Nobody suggested that you are not competent to suggest ways and means. The only thing is that you have not sufficient knowledge of the practical details. You will have to master them. About your competency and accomplishments we are more than satisfied.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—The argument was advanced that a committee composed of non-officials will not be able to give practical suggestions. I submit it is absolutely untenable. Another argument was advanced that Government is a growing machinery and that it should not be tampered with and that Hon'ble Member for the Government side compared Cochin Government with the Government of the British Isles. But it should be remembered that the Government there is a democratic Government while in Cochin it is not the least of it.

Here it is very easy to get the salaries of officers raised. If you go and see the Diwan on one fine morning probably your pay is increased from the next day. We see several heads of departments getting their pay increase from 450—650 to 550—800 without any difficulty whatsoever. In England you can't dream of a civil servant going through the back door to the House Secretary and getting his pay increased in one fine morning. Where there is a popular Government these things will not go on. I submit, Sir, that I have been driven to the necessity to support this resolution.

Mr. P. S. Kesavan Nabudiri.—Sir, The Hon'ble Member for Education said that it is an inconsistent attitude taken by this side of the House when responsible Government by a ministry was demanded which will consequently involve a larger expenditure and at the same a resolution for effecting retrenchments was brought forward.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—The inconsistency was a demand for popular Government by a ministry with fat salaries and at the same time wanting to reduce the cost.

Mr. P. S. Kesavan Nambudiri.—Sir, The Hon'ble Member for Education said that it is an inconsistent attitude taken by this side of the House when responsible Government by a ministry was demanded which will consequently involve a

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

larger expenditure and at the same a resolution for effecting retrenchments was also brought forward.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—The inconsistency was a demand for popular Government by a ministry with fat salaries and at the same time wanting to reduce the cost.

Mr. P. S. Kesavan Nambudiri.—That does not mean Sir that we should not enter upon new schemes. We should see that money is not unnecessarily wasted. If we find that the heads of departments need not be paid so much, we should have the power to reduce their salary. Suppose we find that some money has to be spent in hospitals on medicines, by reducing the expenditure on buildings we should have the power for the same.

And moreover in asking for a ministry we are asking for responsible Government and indirectly having a control over the purse. If there are ministers the heads of departments will be subordinate to them. We will be able to dictate to them. It is highly necessary that we should have a committee of this sort at least at this critical time to operate as a check on the departmental heads. By retrenchment we can find money for expenditure on useful lines.

Mr. A. Sankara Poduval.—Sir, I riso also to support this resolution. Reading the resolution as it is, I fail to see why Government should oppose it at all. It is of a very inoffensive nature. It only asks for facilities to be given to non-officials through the instrumentality of a committee, to find out ways and means for instrument. That is surely an acceptable proposition. To my mind the opposition is occasioned either on account of misunderstanding or of the apprehension that the salaries of high paid officers might be affected thereby. In the course of discussion this aspect may have been referred to. The committee may or may not come to such a conclusion. The objection raised on the ground of expenditure is comparatively trivial. The expenditure incurred in this behalf is certainly right. But the real point is not that. Government officers feel that their dignity might suffer. Dr. Beasant, in one of her political lectures has said that in a democratic form of Government servants of the State, i. e., Government servants are virtually servants of the people. Now it is the wrong mentality of the official and the wrong angle of his political vision, that is responsible for so much controversy. Government servants now seem to suppose that they are units of the Government and that the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

people are subject to them. That is the wrong angle of vision. Here we are for progressive democracy. Passing on to the question whether a non-official committee would be able to do any useful work I can only answer it by an analogy. When the question of women's franchise was raised, males through that females would not be able to carry on work in the Council. When the franchise was conferred on women, they played their part well. So also non-officials would be able to do this work I think quite satisfactorily. Non-officials would demonstrate their competency when they are put on trial. Therefore this resolution is perfectly inoffensive and the ways and means suggested by a non-official committee may be very useful in bringing about retrenchment. Why should Government oppose this resolution? Another argument advanced by the member for the Education is that the Special Finance Committee has reported only a few years ago and the report had been acted upon and it is much too early to appoint a new committee. The recommendations of the Special Finance Committee were not accepted as such (*Hear, hear*). Useful portions of it, useful from the non-official point of view, were left out completely (*hear, hear*), and a reform was introduced, which was neither fish nor flesh. The accepted report is an Aviyal an incongrous mixture of non-official suggesstions, and it has hence led to this state of affairs. We say, give us a chance. If the report be found useful accept it; otherwise discard it. Therefore from all those points of view the committeeas suggested by the Hon'ble mover of this resolution seems to be a useful committee and there is absolutely nothing objectionable about it. The several ways and means of effecting retrenchment may not have been referred to by the mover, which perhaps requires a long time to narrate. I, therefore, support this resolution.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Mr. President, Sir, I do not propose to deal with all the several aspects of the question. I ventured to rise upon this occasion because I had occasion to express my views while I was a non-official member of this House when the report of the Special Finance Committee was discussed. I am reminded of the several observations, made by me on that occasion, which are relevant to this issue. I was not a Government officer at that time and I had no idea of getting a Government job then. Coming as it did from a non-official member it may be taken as entirely disinterested. Several of the Hon'ble Members now present were also members then. I stated among other things as follows:—

"I shall proceed to examine very briefly some aspects of the report in question. I am glad to state at the outset that the Members of the Committee deserve the thanks of the public for

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the conscientious way they have executed their laborious task. The general policy of the report is acceptable to me, although in some important matters of detail I am not at one with them. I know that there is a general impression among the public that our service are very much over paid. I know that a section of the public thinks that the services also should follow the theory of demand and supply. Why not pay the officers very much less than what we are now paying them, if we can get men to do the work for less money? I do not. Sir, see eye to eye with the parties that think in this vein. I am for efficiency cent per cent and no less. I want our services to be above corruption and cheap temptation."

Mr. George Chkyamuri.—You are quoting yourself.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—"Coming to our State I reiterate I am for cent per cent efficiency and no less. I want our public servants to be above want, contented and prosperous and honest. The higher officers have besides to keep up the good name and prestige of our State. I do not want our higher officers to feel like pigmy parodies when in company with corresponding officers of the neighbouring States, of British India, Travancore and Mysore. Let us not reduce our State to the condition of toy States, like Monaco and make it the laughing stock of the country. I do not for a moment to countenance extravagance. I want economy but not of the false and bad variety which is really miserliness.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—Do you mean to say that our officers will be corrupt if their pay is reduced?

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Sir, this opinion expressed by me in 1105 was an unbiased one. I had no idea then of entering the public service at all. Therefore, Sir, it is a disinterested opinion and it is entitled to as much weight as any expressed by the members of the other side of the House to-day.

The House rose for the day at 5 p. m.

C. J. MATHEW,
Secretary to the Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly